City of Sumter Design Review

February 13, 2025

HP-25-01, 220 N. Washington St. (217 Church St.) (City)

I. THE REQUEST

Applicant: 226 North Washington Street, LLC

Status of the Applicant: Authorized Agent for Property Owner

Request: Request for Design Review Approval to demolish existing

motel building.

Location: 220 N. Washington St. (217 Church St.)

Present Use/Zoning: Motel / Professional Office (PO)

Tax Map Reference: 228-05-04-015

Adjacent Property Land

Use and Zoning:

North –Residential / Professional Office (PO)

South – Vacant / Residential-6 (R-6)

East – Hotel / General Commercial (GC) West – Residential / Residential-6 (R-6)

II. BACKGROUND

220 N. Washington St. is a portion of a larger motel development currently known either as the Oyo Hotel or Rodeway Inn.

The applicant is requesting Design Review Board approval to demolish the existing motel building based on its condition as a threat to public safety and loss of architectural integrity.



ARCHITECTURAL/HISTORIC CONTEXT:

Built in 1965, per Sumter County tax records, the current structure on the property is a 2-story concrete block building totaling 20,920 sq. ft. that was built as an expansion to the motel on the adjacent parcel which fronts on N. Washington St. While the building did exist on the site at the time of the 1980 Hampton Park Historic Resources Survey, it was not evaluated or referenced as part of that project.

The motel has changed names many times since the original construction, most of which have happened in the last 15 years, including Oyo, Rodeway Inn, Econolodge, Palmetto Inn, Ramada Inn, and Holiday Inn.



Figure 1 - 1957 Aerial Imagery depicting single-family homes previously built on the site.

In 2020, the property owner obtained Design Review approval to paint the exterior of the building (HP-20-12).

The site is located in the Hampton Park Historic Overlay District, but is not considered a contributing site to the fabric of the District.

CURRENT CONDITIONS



Above Left: Motel building as viewed from northwest corner of property (Church St. ROW)



Above Right: Motel building as viewed from southwest corner of property (Church St. ROW)



Above Left: Motel building façade directly facing Church St.



Above Right: Existing Brick Wall/Fence on north, west, and south property lines (only damaged section shown)

SCOPE OF WORK:

The applicant proposes to perform the following work:

A. Demolish existing motel building



Figure 2 - Overall Site Layout

DESIGN REVIEW:

The proposed work requires design review approval beforehand. The *Design Review Guidelines Manual* states:

7.2 Demolition

- A. Demolish a historic building only after all alternatives have been exhausted.
 - Provide an explanation of alternatives that were explored and the reasons why they were not feasible options.
 - > Prepare a detailed plan for the development of the site that includes a budget for both the demolition and the new construction, as well as a timetable.
 - Document the building prior to demolition to include measured drawings, photographs, and a detailed history of the property.

Requirements for Demolition: Demolition may only be approved if one or more of the following conditions are met:

- ➤ Public Safety Hazard When the local building official has determined that the physical condition of the building constitutes a hazard to the safety and welfare of the public.
- > Loss of Architectural Integrity When a building has lost its original architectural integrity of location, setting, design, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association to a point that it no longer contributes to the historic character of the district.
- Loss of Structural Integrity When a building has deteriorated and is structurally unstable. This condition must be demonstrated in a report by a licensed architect or structural engineer that fully documents the building's physical condition, provides a reasonable cost estimate for the necessary repairs, and justifies why such repairs are not feasible.
- ➤ Economic Hardship When economic hardship has been demonstrated and proven by the property owner and such hardship is accepted by the HPDRC. A detailed report should be

provided that includes a reasonable estimate of rehabilitation costs and evidence that the potential value of the property cannot produce a financial return on such investment.

Staff Analysis:

The Design Review Guidelines for demolition are intended to ensure that the full cultural, historic, and architectural character of a structure is considered and evaluated before it is irrevocably removed. The Guidelines specify that demolition may only be approved if at least 1 of 4 conditions are met. Those conditions are 1) Public Safety Hazard, 2) Loss of Architectural Integrity, 3) Loss of Structural Integrity, and/or 4) Economic Hardship.

Specific analysis of the 4 criteria is contained below:

- 1) **Public Safety Hazard**: The building has been evaluated by the Sumter City-County Building Official. The Building Official has determined it to be non-compliant with building code requirements, as it constitutes a hazard to the safety and welfare of the public. Additionally, public safety is threatened by numerous criminal activities, including shootings, that have required extensive law enforcement response.
 - Staff Evaluation: Condition met
- 2) Loss of Architectural Integrity: There do not appear to be any architectural characteristics that merit preservation/restoration.
 - Staff Evaluation: Condition met
- 3) Loss of Structural Integrity: While the building is in a clear state of decay and disrepair, the specific details concerning structural integrity have not been established by a licensed architect or structural engineer that fully documents the building's physical condition, provides a reasonable cost estimate for the necessary repairs, and justifies why such repairs are not feasible.
 - Staff Evaluation: Insufficient data to confirm condition
- 4) **Economic Hardship**: It is unclear whether investment in the building could make sense from a financial standpoint. A detailed report has not been submitted that includes a reasonable estimate of rehabilitation costs and evidence that the potential value of the property cannot produce a financial return on such investment.
 - Staff Evaluation: Insufficient data to confirm condition

III. STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of this request based on conditions #1 and #2 as outlined in the City of Sumter Design Review Guidelines, Section 7.2.

IV. DRAFT MOTION

- 1) I move the City of Sumter Design Review Board <u>approve</u> HP-25-01 in accordance with the materials, photographs, construction details submitted and staff recommendation referenced in the Staff Report based on compliance with Design Review Guidelines.
- 2) I move the City of Sumter Design Review Board <u>deny</u> HP-25-01.
- 3) I move the City of Sumter Design Review Board enter an alternative motion.

V. DESIGN REVIEW BOARD - February 13, 2025

